

ordered that J. B. Marrs be and he is hereby allowed the sum of \$60.00 for salary as police judge for month of September, 1924.

ordered that J. B. Marrs be and he is hereby allowed the sum of \$40.00 for salary or clerk hire for police judges office for September, 1924.

ordered that A. L. Raitley be and he is hereby allowed the sum of \$50.00 for salary as city attorney for month of September, 1924.

Ordered that W. J. Anderson be and he is hereby allowed the sum of \$200.00 for salary as street cleaner for month of September, 1924.

Ordered that Frank L. Haynes be and he is hereby allowed the sum of \$2600.00 for engineering services relative to street paving for month of September, 1924.

upon motion made, duly seconded and carried council adjourned until Friday, October 10, 1924.

attest: J. L. Jackson City Clerk. approved: J. L. Thompson Mayor.

At a regular adjourned meeting of the Common Council of the City of Pikeville, Kentucky, held in the city hall in the city of Pikeville, Kentucky, on the 10th day of October, 1924. The following were present: Mayor J. L. Thompson and Councilmen A. J. Raitley, R. Thompson, L. A. Duty, Jerry Robinson and J. L. Parker.

Engineer D. E. Davis representing the J. M. Chester Engineers, Union Bank Building, Pittsburg, Pa., appeared in open council and filed his report with reference to the various bids received by the city with respect to the water works system which said report and recommendations was read to Council, and which is in words and figures as follows:

To the Honorable Mayor and Council: Pikeville, Ky., Oct. 10, 1924.

Dear Sirs: The bids for your proposed water works and filtration plant were opened at noon on Tuesday, October 7, and read publicly and tabulated. We beg to set forth the results of our study of these bids and to present our recommendations bearing thereon.

Item no. 1. Excavation, grading and concrete for filter plant. Bids were received from the following contractors on this item:

Fred Bruner Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	\$16,000.00
Campbell Constr. Co., and W. J. Huffman, Pikeville, Ky.,	17,875.70

Hatfield Construction Co., Huntington W. Va., \$18,000.00. The Bruner Co. is a responsible bidder, and as their contract offers the lowest bid it is recommended that the award be made to the Bruner Co. at the bid of \$16,000.00.

Item no. 2 - Superstructure for Filter Plant.

Bids on this item were received as follows:

Campbell Constr. Co. and W. J. Huffman, Pikeville, Ky.	\$8,628.39
Fred Bruner Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	9,100.00
Hatfield Const. Co., Huntington, W. Va.	11,400.00

We recommend that this award be made to the lowest responsible bidder, namely, the Campbell Constr. Co. and W. J. Huffman of Pikeville, Ky., at their bid of \$8,628.39.

Item no. 3 - Filter equipment and outside piping.

Two bids were received on this item from:

F. B. Leopold, Pittsburg, Pa.	\$16,300.00
Pittsburg-Des Moines Steel Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	21,200.00

It is recommended that this award be made to F. B. Leopold of Pittsburg, Pa., as being the lowest responsible bidder at his price of \$16,300.00.

Item no. 4 - Settling Basin.

Four bids were received on this item as follows:

Chicago Bridge and Iron Works, Chicago, Ill.	\$2,770.00
R. D. Cole Co., Newman, Ga.	3,000.00
Pittsburg-Des Moines Steel Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	3,700.00
James McNeil Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	4,250.00

As the Chicago Bridge and Iron Co. is the lowest bidder and a responsible firm, we recommend that the award be made to them at their bid of \$2,770.00.

Item no. 5 - Steel Reservoir Tank.

Bids were received from the same parties as bid upon Item no. 4, as follows:

Chicago Bridge and Iron Works, Chicago, Ill.	\$5,100.00
R. D. Cole Co., Newman, Ga.	5,300.00
Pittsburg-Des Moines Steel Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	6,200.00
James McNeil Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	8,500.00

The Chicago Bridge and Iron Co. being the lowest bidder on this item, it is recommended that the award be made to this firm at its stated price of \$5,100.00.

Item no. 6 - Excavation and concrete work for Reservoir Tank.

The bidders on this item were:

The Fred Bruner Co. - Pittsburg, Pa.	\$1,800.00
The Hatfield Const. Co. - Huntington W. Va.	9,600.00

It is recommended that the bid of the Fred Bruner Co., of Pittsburg, Pa., be accepted as being the lowest bid offered.

Item no. 7 - Low Service Centrifugal Pumps.

Nine bids were received as follows:

	Price	Efficiency
F. B. Leopold Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	\$1,850.00	60%
The Miller Supply Co., Huntington, W. Va.	1,465.70	63 1/2%
Dravo-Doyle Co., Pittsburg, Pa.	1,590.00	53
Hairbank & Moore Co., Cincinnati, O.	1,264.00	52.1
Dayton-Dowd Co., Cincinnati, O.	1,270.00	53.0
Allen-Chalmers Co.	1,470.00	not stated
Huntington Pump & Mach. Corp.	1,635.00	59.5
Loaned Mfg. Co., Pgh., Pa.	1,750.30	59.6
Schubert-Christy & Mach. Co., St. Louis, Mo.	2,311.00	52

Item no. 8 - High service pump and wash pump.
will be considered with no. 7 as they are intimately associated on the work, the same bidder listed above also presented bids on this item as follows:

Bidder	Combination Price	Efficiencies	
		High Ss.	Wash.
H. B. Leopold -			
The Miller Supply Co. ---	\$2975	56%	70%
	2552 90	61.2	72.6
Gravo-Duyle Co.	2612	56	67
Hairbanks-Morse Co.	2518	52.2	66.7
Dayton-Dowd Co.	2490	56.7	67.75
Allis-Chalmers Co.	2720	not stated	
Worthington Pump & Mach. Corp.	2653		52
Goulds Mfg. Co.	2661 20	50.2	65.4
Schubert-Christy Co.	3156	58.	65.5

It will be noted that in every instance the highest efficiencies are shown by the pumps offered by The Miller Supply Co. of Huntington, W. Va. bidding on the 140 horse power pump. The more efficient a pump, the less your electric bill for pumping, hence the necessity of giving careful consideration to the pump efficiencies, since the savings in electricity will soon make up the difference in first cost. The total bid of The Miller Supply Co. on items no. 7 and 8 is \$4018.60, or \$2552.60 higher than the lowest bid, and \$1448.40 under the highest bid. In view of the fact that they offer the highest efficiencies, and are third lowest in price, we recommend that the award be made this company at its bid of \$4018.60.

Item no. 9 - 6" 8" and 10" Cast Iron Pipes

Two bids were received as follows:

National Cast Iron Pipe Co., Birmingham, Ala.,	\$52.25 per ton
American Cast Iron Pipe Co., "	53.60 " "

Each party is a responsible concern and it is recommended that the award be made to the lower of the two at its unit price of \$52.25 per ton.

Item no. 10 - Cast Iron Specials

The same two bidders were represented as in the previous item, their offers being at the same price of \$111.60 per ton. It is recommended that the award be made the National Cast Iron Pipe Co. of Birmingham, Ala.

Items no. 11-12-13 - applying to 10" 8" and 6" gate valves, respectively.

Bids were received from four bidders as follows:

Pennsallan Valve Co., Pittsburg, Pa.,	\$61	\$40.26	25.62
Ludlow Valve Co., Troy, N. Y.,	61	40.25	25.62
Darling Value Co., Williamsport, Pa.,	61	40.30	25.65
Schubert-Christy Co.,	57.55	39.45	24.85

There is a difference of only \$93.20 in a total of nearly \$3000 between the lowest and the highest bidder. We are unacquainted with the product of the lowest bidder, and where all bidders are practically on a basis of price equality, we are loath to take a chance on an unknown product. Any of the first three bidders offer a good standard product and no mistake would be made in giving the award to any one of them. As is often the case, the deciding factor turns on what material is now in use. We find that you have Ludlow hydrants, and as their price is low on that item, we recommend that the award on items no. 11, 12 & 13 be made to them on the basis of the unit prices bid.

Item no. 14 - Valve Boxes.

Four bids were received as follows:

Pennsallan Valve Co.,	\$6.10
Ludlow, " "	6.00
Darling, " "	5.20
Schubert-Christy Co.,	6.45

It is recommended that the award be made the Darling Value Co. at their unit price of \$5.20 each.

Item no. 15 - Fire Hydrants.

Bids were received from four bidders:

Pennsallan Valve Co.,	\$6.03
Ludlow Valve Co.,	5.62
Darling Value Co.,	5.65
Schubert-Christy Co.,	6.22

The cheapest bid is that offered by the Ludlow Value Co., and as you now have many of that type of hydrant in service, it may be well to continue the type for sake of uniformity. We would recommend that the award be made that company, at its unit price of \$5.62.

Item no. 16 A - Hauling and laying cast iron pipe, valves, hydrants, new system.

Bids on sections 1 to 30d complete were received from the following:

Pittsburg Des Moines Steel Co., Pgh., Pa.,	
Fred Bruner Co., Pgh., Pa.,	
The comparison of bids on the basis of the award is as follows:	
Fred Bruner Co., Pittsburg, Pa.,	\$24,710.00
Pgh. Des Moines Steel Co., " "	31,250.00

It is recommended that the award be made to the Fred Bruner Co. as the lowest bidder on the basis of his stated prices.

Item no. 16 B - Hauling and laying Cast Iron Pipe, valves, hydrants, on extension of existing system.

This item was an alternate to 16A and was to be used in the event the city acquired the existing system. Since the Council has decided to proceed with the construction of an entirely new system, this alternate will not come into use.

Item no. 17 - Furnishing and constructing extra length of river intake.

This item automatically attaches to Item no. 3 as it applies to the work of that contractor.

Items no. 18-19-20 - Extra Earth Excavation, Extra Rock Excavation, extra plain concrete, and extra reinforcing steel.

These items cover unit prices on possible extra work encountered by the contractor awarded Items no. 1, 6 & 16, and automatically follow the award of those items.

Items 23-24 & 25 - Reduction of deadends on 6-8 & 10" pipes.

These items apply to work done by the contractor under Item no. 16 and automatically attach to the successful bid on that item.

The total of the obligations incurred by the city on entering into the contracts upon the items discussed above will be in the neighborhood of \$104,386.99, which when considered in connection with other obligations already incurred will keep your total anticipated expenditures within the available funds.

Yours very truly,
The J. N. Cluster Engineers
D. E. Davis.

The following supplemental report was attached to and filed with the original report, which is as follows: "Oct. 11, 1924.

To the Honorable Mayor and Council, Pikeville, Ky.:

Dear Sirs: Since the presentation of our recommendations at the Council meeting of last night the Mountain Water Company has met the city's offer for its distribution system and the offer has been accepted by the city. It therefore becomes necessary to substitute the pipe laying items upon the extension of the old system, (Item 16B) in place of Item 16A as recommended last night, and which covered an entirely new system.

Bids on sections 1 to 28, inclusive, were received from The Fred Bruner Co., Pittsburg, Pa., and the Bgl Des Moines Steel Co., a lump sum bid from J. N. Huffman, of Pikeville, Ky., which bid also included Items 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15. The latter bid was high on the comparison of all items.

The comparison of bids on the basis of the award is as follows:

Fred Bruner Co., Pittsburg, Pa., \$10,400
Bgl Des Moines Steel Co., " " 11,725.

It is recommended that the award be made to the Fred Bruner Co., as the lowest bidder on the basis of his stated prices.

The total of the obligations incurred by the city on entering into the contracts upon the items discussed above will be in the neighborhood of \$18,545.22 which when considered in connection with other obligations already incurred will keep your total expenditures within the available funds.

Yours very truly,
The J. N. Chester Engineers
D. E. Davis

A. J. Ratliff moved that the foregoing report and recommendations of the J. N. Chester Engineers be received. Jerry Robinson seconded said motion, which carried.

The committee heretofore appointed to investigate and make report as to whether or not Eastern Kentucky Home Telephone Company should be granted increase in rates, filed written report, declining to grant such increase.

A. J. Ratliff moved that said report be accepted, and that copy of same be sent to the Eastern Kentucky Home Telephone Company, together with the audit of the telephone company, and that the Council decline to raise the telephone rates of the Eastern Kentucky Home Telephone Company, based on the report from the auditor's books of the Eastern Kentucky Home Telephone Company. Jerry Robinson seconded said motion, which carried.

Upon motion made, duly seconded and carried Council granted W. M. Seals permit to erect one and one-half story building on lot purchased from Annie Maynard, pursuant to terms of city ordinance.

upon motion made, duly seconded and carried, it is ordered that the J. N. Chester Engineers be allowed the sum of \$1150.00 to be paid by the city treasurer out of the Pikeville Water Works system fund, as follows:

Item 1. No investigation and report on a complete water works system, \$750.00
Item 2. Investigation, appraisal and report on present water works system and assistance in negotiations, \$400.00
If Items 3, 4 and 5 are proceeded with, deduct 100.00
\$1150.00

upon motion made, duly seconded and carried, it is ordered that Engineering News-Record, New York, N. Y., be allowed the sum of \$63.60 for advertising for bids for installation of Pikeville Water Works system as per bill of October 2, 1924, to be paid out of water works system fund.

J. N. Huffman presented deed for water works site on east Bank Street, which was passed over.

Jerry Robinson moved that W. E. Yost be permitted to lower alley abutting River View Drive extending north between property of W. E. Yost and Harriet Ratliff, A. J. Ratliff seconded said motion, which carried.

Seaton Prestor, representing Kentucky and West Virginia Power Company, appeared in open Council and discussed the matter of new light franchise for City of Pikeville. The Mayor appointed as a committee to confer with Kentucky and West Virginia Power Company with reference to same, the following: A. J. Ratliff, J. J. Parker and K. J. Day.

Jerry Robinson tendered his resignation as a member of the Street Committee. A. J. Ratliff moved that said resignation be accepted. R. Thompson seconded said motion, which carried.

L. A. Duty moved that A. J. Ratliff be appointed as a member of the Street Committee in lieu of Jerry Robinson. Jerry Robinson seconded said motion, which carried.

The Mayor thereupon appointed A. J. Ratliff as a member of the Street Committee in lieu of Jerry Robinson, resigned.

Upon motion made, duly seconded and carried Council is adjourned until tomorrow, October 11th 1924 at nine o'clock A. M.

Attest:
City Clerk.

Approved:
R. Thompson
Mayor.